

# EXHIBIT A

**ЎЗБЕКИСТОН РЕСПУБЛИКАСИ  
АДЛИЯ ВАЗИРЛИГИ**



**МИНИСТЕРСТВО ЮСТИЦИИ  
РЕСПУБЛИКИ УЗБЕКИСТАН**

100047, Тошкент шаҳри, Сайилгоҳ кўчаси, 5-уй  
Тел.: (998 71) 233 39 38 Факс: (998 71) 233 48 44  
www.minjust.uz, эл. почта: info@minjust.gov.uz

100047, город Ташкент, улица Сайилгоҳ, 5  
Тел.: (998 71) 233 39 38 Факс: (998 71) 233 48 44  
www.minjust.uz, эл. почта: info@minjust.gov.uz

“16” December 2015  
No. 1-16/3-1307/8

**Andrew L.Carter, Jr.**  
United States District Judge  
Southern District of New York

**Upon your request dated November 23, 2015, addressed to  
Madumarov R., Avakyan G. and others**

Prosecutor General's Office of the Republic of Uzbekistan, in the framework of criminal case on conviction of the members of organized group led by Madumarov R. and included Avakyan G., Akhmedov B., Ergashev A., Sabirov Sh. and others, arrested the incoming correspondence.

November 28 and December 2, 2015, mail correspondence, which was sent by you to the addresses of abovementioned persons, in particular Orders to Show Cause that confute Verified Complaint of the US Government as represented by Department of Justice on Motion for Default Judgment on Forfeiture of the assets of Investment Fund “First Global Investment Ltd”, and all accumulated profits and incomes of involved persons traceable thereto, has been suppressed.

In this regard, we consider it necessary to inform you that Madumarov R., Avakyan G. and others were sentenced to long-term imprisonment, pursuant to Tashkent Region (Uzbekistan) Court’s Criminal Sentence dated July 20, 2015, and found guilty for execution of crime, pursuant to Articles 167 (misappropriation) Sec.3 §§(a)(c), 168 (fraud) Sec.3 §§(a)(c), 178 (concealment of foreign currency) Sec.3, 184 (tax evasion) Sec.3, 209 (official forgery) Sec.2 §§(a)(b), 243 (legalization of criminal incomes) and other articles of Criminal Code of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

Corrupt payments (indicated in the complaint of Department of Justice attached to your request) transferred by telecommunication companies “MTS” and “Vimpelcom” to the accounts of “Takilant”, “Swisdorn” and “Expoline” owned by Madumarov R. and others, as well as legalization (laundering) of these criminal incomes by creation of fund “First Global Investment Ltd” and acquisition of its assets, are completely covered by conviction filed against Madumarov R. and others.

Incomes of Madumarov R., Avakyan G. and others, which were received from their criminal activity on the territory of the Republic of Uzbekistan and taken out of the country through conspiratorial criminal-economic schemes, were used to acquire all foreign assets (including the assets of aforementioned Fund).

Pursuant to abovementioned Court's Sentence that came into legal force, assets of "First Global Investment Ltd" and other legalized property of organized group were appropriated by the Republic of Uzbekistan.

In accordance with §7 Article 14 of International Pact on Civil and Political Rights – "no one can be tried for the second time or punished for the crime for which he/she was already convicted or acquitted pursuant to the law of criminal procedure of any country".

Pursuant to requirements of subparagraphs (a), (b) §3 Article 57 of the UN Convention against Corruption, member state in case of misappropriation of public funds or laundering of misappropriated public funds, and incomes from any other crime, in accordance with court's final sentence issued in requesting member state, returns forfeited property to requesting member state.

Consequently, all foreign legalized assets of Madumarov R., Avakyan G. and other involved persons including property, on forfeiture of which the US Government has claimed, are subject to return to Uzbekistan.

Currently, we are translating Court's Sentence on criminal cases of Tashkent Region (Uzbekistan) with regard to Madumarov R., Avakyan G. and others, and preparing relevant materials in order to send them to the competent authorities of foreign countries for execution (related to forfeiture of organized group's foreign assets) in established order.

According to abovementioned, we do not find it reasonable to further consider Complaint of the US Government on Forfeiture of the assets of "First Global Investment Ltd" and other foreign property of involved persons, since adoption of such court decision may contradict aforementioned international norms.

Since there is ongoing investigation on the fragments from aforementioned criminal cases that singled out in separate court proceedings, we would like to ask you to keep abovementioned information confidential.

With respect,  
**Minister of Justice**  
of the Republic of Uzbekistan



M.Ikramov